BOARD OF TRUSTEES
REGULAR MEETING
MINUTES
June 18, 2013
Oakland Community College
2480 Opdyke Road
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304

# 1. GENERAL FUNCTIONS

# 1.1 Call to Order and Welcome

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chair Kelly.

#### 1.2 Attendance

**Present** 

Daniel Kelly, Chair Thomas Sullivan, Vice Chair Pamala Davis, Secretary Thomas Kuhn, Treasurer (left at 9:08 p.m.) Shirley Bryant, Trustee Christine O'Sullivan, Trustee Sandra Ritter, Trustee

Absent

None

# 1.3 Approval of Agenda

Trustee O'Sullivan MOVED Arts, Beats and Eats be added to the agenda. Trustee Davis seconded.

AYES: Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Ritter

NAYS: Bryant and Sullivan Motion Carried

Trustee Ritter MOVED to add the topic "Board Interaction" to the agenda. Trustee Davis seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

Trustee Sullivan MOVED to approve the agenda as amended. Trustee Davis seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

Under New Business, Chair Kelly added Arts, Beats and Eats as item 6.3 and Board Interaction as 6.4.

#### 1.4 Public Comments/Petitions –

Gerry Faye, faculty member from Orchard Ridge, addressed the Board regarding faculty positions which he believes are not being replaced as of this moment. He contended the College has \$219 million in the bank. It is Mr. Faye's opinion the real reason for this is to build a new division of college readiness in spite of the fact he believes we already serve those in need of basic English and math.

Lisa Nemitz, academic support faculty at Orchard Ridge, distributed a handout to the Board entitled, "An Introduction to the Academic Support Centers." She provided an overview of their core programs, which are CRLA tutoring, supplemental instruction, and seminars. She feels the fluctuating budgets over the past five years have affected the support they are able to provide to the students.

Mike Robinson, ASC faculty at the Auburn Hills Campus, referenced a handout he distributed entitled, "Academic Support Center Success." He discussed the handout with the Board, which is a study of the effectiveness of the ASC on the Auburn Hills Campus using data from fall 2008.

Leah Michels, member of Division of College Readiness at the Orchard Ridge Campus for English, stated she began her career as a tutor. She addressed the Board regarding the need for tutors in her classroom. She contended in-class tutors speak the language of teachers and students and can mediate the gulf between the two. She intuited to the Board that without her in-class tutors, she would not be as effective of an instructor and communicator to her students.

Robert Lamphear, English faculty at Highland Lakes Campus, advised the Board the letter he read at last month's Board meeting was sent to the Higher Learning Commission. He reviewed previous HLC findings with the Board.

Ruth Weinbaum stated she is a student who attended OCC ceramic classes for over 20 years. She has an associate's degree in applied science and a ceramics technology certificate. During this time she attended classes at Highland Lakes, Auburn Hills, Orchard Ridge, and Royal Oak. She addressed the Board asking OCC to continue their exemplary arts and humanities classes.

Rachel Caine stated she has been a student with OCC since 2009 and also acquired her associate's degree in liberal arts and is currently working on her ceramics technology certificate. She too voiced her desire for the continuation of the ceramics program as she plans to continue her ceramics classes even after she has completed her ceramic certificate.

Derrick Garland, a student at OCC, addressed the Board regarding financial aid he received from OCC.

John Witz introduced himself as the representative for the Arts, Beats and Eats Festival. He addressed the letter he sent to the Trustees and the Chancellor relating to concerns about the use of two OCC properties critical to the festival.

Michele Martin addressed the Board as a parent whose daughter attends the Royal Oak Campus. Her daughter has taken ceramics classes. Mrs. Martin expressed her views that OCC should support all programs, it's not just about the beginning student, it is about community.

Angela Martin is a resident from Berkley who expressed her opinion regarding the OCC ceramics program as her sister was a ceramics student here. She stated she was also a regular customer of the pieces made by OCC ceramic students and would like to see the program continued.

Carol Parker introduced herself as an art and French teacher who has taken ceramics classes at various OCC campuses. She indicated she heard rumors OCC plans to close its ceramics program, and they will no longer hire full-time instructors, but hire adjuncts. She voiced her concerns regarding these two rumors and her support for the ceramics program.

Jean Norman, an adjunct instructor, reminded the Board we are a community college, not a corporation. Ms. Norman covered a variety of topics from ceramics to student instructors and tutoring to staffing.

Elizabeth Lurie stated for the past 40 years she has been a practicing ceramist, and has been a student at OCC off and on for the past 29 years. She voiced she would like students like her to continue having access to the arts at OCC.

Kathy Schulte, department chair of nursing, raised concerns regarding the nursing program and the closure of the mobile nursing clinic.

Nursing student Megan Perkoviq also voiced her concerns regarding the cancellation of the nursing mobile clinic where students were able to practice their skills.

# 1.5 Student Presentation – None

# 1.6 Approval of May Board Meeting Minutes

1.6.1 Approval of May 7, 2013 Special Meeting Minutes

Trustee Sullivan MOVED to approve the minutes of the May 7, 2013 special Board meeting. Trustee Bryant seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

1.6.2 Approval of May 21, 2013 Regular Meeting Minutes

Trustee Ritter MOVED to approve the minutes of the May 21, 2013 regular Board meeting. Trustee Bryant seconded.

Trustee Ritter noted she was absent from the meeting, but watched the recording and noted there were more comments than referenced in the minutes. She feels anything discussed, especially when the Board receives documentation, should be attached to the minutes so people understand there was more than just comments being made. She asked any written comments be given to the Board and included as an attachment to the minutes.

Chair Kelly replied generally the secretary reviews the recording, and asked Trustee Ritter if there is a particular section she's referring to. Trustee Ritter was uncertain. Chair Kelly then asked if she was referring to the Public Comments section. She said yes. Chair Kelly stated the minutes are a summary of the business meeting and documents from public comments are not attached. She then asked for the language to be included verbatim. Chair Kelly said there is a summary in the minutes of the people who spoke under Public Comments. She said she feels it is important if an individual or group gives the Board a written document of what they are saying it should be included verbatim in the minutes.

There being no further discussion, Chair Kelly called for the vote on the motion to approve the May 21, 2013 minutes as presented.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Sullivan

NAYS: Ritter (was not in attendance) Motion Carried

# 2. CHANCELLOR'S REPORT

#### 2.1 Chancellor's Comments

Dr. Meyer was pleased to announce OCC took second place out of 197 participating colleges at the Midwest Region National Math Competition sponsored by the American Mathematical Association of Two Year Colleges. Nationally our group scored above the 90<sup>th</sup> percentile with OCC students Edgar Hu taking second place and Sandeep Siva taking fourth place. Dr. Meyer also thanked the math faculty for a job well done.

# 2.2 Staff Report – None

# 2.3 Introduction of New Staff

Vice Chancellor of Administrative Services Clarence Brantley introduced Cherie Nolff, an analyst with Financial Services at District Office.

Associate Vice Chancellor of Academic and Student Affairs Cathey Maze introduced Dr. Timothy Sherwood, the academic dean of the Mathematics/Natural and Life Sciences Departments at the Highland Lakes Campus.

#### 3. ACADEMIC AND STUDENT AFFAIRS

# 3.1 Academic Senate Reports

College Academic Senate Chair Shawn Dry continued his senate presentation on four elements of College participation: deliberative process, advisory proposals, reports, and communication.

Trustee Sullivan thanked Mr. Dry for his presentation. He asked if the senate always existed at OCC. Mr. Dry replied he was told there was some type of senate-like activity since 1965. Trustee Sullivan asked if the senate is unique to OCC. Mr. Dry said the Chancellor indicated in the past he knew of four Michigan community colleges that had senates. Trustee Sullivan asked if the senate has a stated mission. Mr. Dry was unable to respond, but past chair Mary Ann McGee said a statement appears on the senate handouts used since the early 1990's.

Faculty member Gerald Faye stood up and stated he served on the first faculty advisory committee enjoined by Dr. Tirrell, the first president of OCC. Under the second president Dr. Hill, it emerged similar to what we have now.

Trustee Sullivan asked how many motions were submitted by the senate last year. Mr. Dry responded about 12 motions for 2012-2013.

Trustee Sullivan inquired if there is compensation for members of the senate. Mr. Dry responded there is not compensation for all members of the senate. However, the College senate chair, each campus senate chair, and the chair of the long-term standing committees (i.e., planning, curriculum review) are compensated. Trustee Sullivan asked if it is an annual stipend/compensation or is it based upon hours. Mr. Dry said it is based upon the individual. If it is a faculty member, compensation is based upon release time and they are paid as if they are teaching a course. Trustee Sullivan followed up asking if the senate has a budget. Mr. Dry said there is not one for the senate itself, but it has been something they have asked for in the past as there are conferences they would like to attend. Trustee Sullivan asked Mr. Dry what it costs for the senate to exist. Mr. Dry said compensation is based upon release time and the amount of compensation differs varying upon what salary a particular faculty member makes--someone who has a higher salary will have a more expensive release time.

# 3.2 Student Reports - None

3.3 Academic Initiatives – "Completion: An Institutional Priority" – Timothy Meyer, Chancellor

Dr. Meyer began by stating we often talk about the distribution of resources – where should this position go, where should this funding go, where should this support go. The answer is it needs to follow the direction of where the College is going.

Dr. Meyer presented data collected by Marty Orlowski [Executive Director of Curriculum and Student Learning] regarding student success. Looking at OCC's completion of degrees (excluding certificates), Dr. Meyer stated of the 28 community colleges in Michigan, OCC was the fourth largest in awarding degrees/certificates (2,839). Looking at it more closely, OCC is the third lowest in degree completions of full-time students within a three-year completion period. Dr. Meyer continued that 58 percent of associate degrees awarded at OCC are from four of the 87 programs offered. Ninety percent of the other associate degrees awarded are from 27 programs. Lastly, 60 programs split the remaining 10 percent of associate degrees awarded. Dr. Meyer indicated the top four programs consist of Liberal Arts, General Studies, Nursing, and Business Administration. Dr. Meyer said there is an even split of students coming to us for transfer and for vocational programs.

When we talk about our community college we ask who do we serve and how we should serve them, and what efforts do we put toward vocational studies, what do we put toward transfer studies, and what do we put toward developmental education. That's what our strategic plan identifies - college readiness, transfer readiness, and employment readiness. Dr. Meyer continued by stating 80 percent of OCC certificates awarded are from 22 programs and the remaining 20 percent are split among 63 programs.

Trustee Bryant asked who is involved in these discussions. Dr. Meyer responded it is not a strictly internal discussion, but involves the College community (Oakland County). Trustee Bryant asked if the College Brain Trust addressed any of these ideas. Dr. Meyer said not specifically. When they looked at the Educational Master Plan, they identified the five areas what good colleges do. We need to continually evolve and evaluate to ensure we are relevant with our community. Trustee Bryant indicated the information presented to the Board tonight was very complex. Dr. Meyer said the first thing is for everyone to understand the direction of the College.

Trustee Ritter noted we had given six welder certificates. She inquired if one really has to have an associate degree to be an excellent welder? She stated individuals need to know what jobs the community needs filled in order for them to take appropriate classes. In the past, Trustee Ritter said there were Board Reference Committees where Board members go out into the community and listen to employers, government, and others as to their needs. She feels it's important for the College to interact with the community.

#### 4. COLLEGE RESOURCES

- 4.1 Personnel Monitoring Report
  - 4.1.1 The Board of Trustees reviewed the revised Personnel Monitoring Report.
  - 4.1.2 Faculty Recommendations

Trustee Bryant MOVED to approve the revised Faculty Recommendations Report. Trustee Sullivan seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

- 4.2 Business and Finance
  - 4.2.1 Treasurer's Report

The Board of Trustees reviewed the Treasurer's Report.

4.2.2 General Fund Budget Status Report

The Board had no questions regarding the General Fund Budget Status Report.

4.2.3 Approval of Tuition Rates

Trustee Kuhn MOVED to adopt Option 1 for tuition rates. Trustee Bryant seconded.

As a point of information, Trustee Sullivan asked for clarification on the proposals before the Board, which Mr. Brantley explained.

Trustee Kuhn MOVED to amend his motion to adopt Option 2 which provides for the following annual increase: 7 percent In-District, 11 percent Out-of District, and 11 percent Out-of-State returning or current students, and \$304/credit hour for new students from out of state. Trustee Bryant seconded.

Trustee Sullivan noted at some point in time he would like to see OCC move closer to the state average for In-District tuition. Although OCC takes pride in its low tuition rates, the Oakland County taxpayers are subsidizing individual tuition to a great extent.

Trustee Ritter said many students budget ahead of time for their education, so we need to give more advance notice if in the future we plan to significantly increase our tuition rates.

Chair Kelly confirmed with Mr. Brantley the proposed tuition rates are to be implemented fall of 2013 and this increase is just for one year. Chair Kelly also confirmed with Mr. Brantley in order to adjust future tuition rates, this matter would need to be brought back before the Board.

Chair Kelly stated when he first was on the Board he was not in favor of a tuition increase; but over the course of the last couple years of being the lowest in the state and providing a good service, he is convinced the proposed tuition increases are reasonable, and he will support the motion.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, Kuhn, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

4.2.4 Trustee Sullivan MOVED to adopt the 2013-2014 General Fund Budget in the amount of \$155,530,433. Trustee O'Sullivan seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Sullivan

NAYS: Ritter Motion Carried

# 4.3 College Facilities

4.3.1 The Board of Trustees reviewed the Progress Report – Construction Projects.

#### 4.4 Contracts and Purchases

4.4.1 Ammunition and Supplies
Oakland Police Academy
Auburn Hills Campus

Trustee Ritter MOVED for the Board of Trustees to approve the purchase of ammunition at a cost not to exceed \$93,559 and related supplies at a cost not to exceed \$5,000 from Michigan Police Equipment for a total cost not to exceed \$98,559 for the 2013-2014 fiscal year. Trustee Bryant seconded.

Trustee Sullivan inquired why there were no additional bids from other vendors, especially since this is not a unique service or piece of equipment. Mr. Brantley replied he can't really provide an answer, other than to say the bids were sent out and only one response was received.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

# 4.4.2 Student Help Desk College-Wide

Trustee Ritter MOVED for the Board of Trustees to approve the use of Blackboard for Help Desk services for OCC students at a cost not to exceed \$55,920 annually through June 30, 2016. Trustee Sullivan seconded.

Trustee Ritter asked if Blackboard is a new thing. Interim CIO Robert Montgomery responded Blackboard has been in place for a number of years. Blackboard was with Learning Management Systems Company, which is the company who acquired Presidium who is the company OCC has been doing business with over the last couple of years. Trustee Ritter then asked Mr. Montgomery if he can verify the need for the \$55,920 annually. Mr. Montgomery said he could based on past history and the number of monthly calls from students.

# 5 UNFINISHED BUSINESS

5.1 2013-2014 Board of Trustees Regular Meeting and Conference Schedule

Trustee Bryant MOVED to approve the 2013-2014 18- month Board of Trustees Regular Meeting and Conference Schedule dates, per Board Travel Expense Policy 1.6.5A. approve the attendance of Board members during this 18-month schedule from two to three trips at the conferences noted, and authorize related travel expenses. There was no support and the motion failed.

Trustee Sullivan proposed a friendly amendment to note on the July and December meetings "as needed." He indicated historically because of the MCCA Summer Workshop in July, those meetings have been cancelled, as have some of the December meetings due to the lack of College business needing to be addressed. If it was decided meetings were required during those months, then they could certainly be scheduled. Trustee Bryant seconded.

Trustee Ritter would also like to see the Agenda Review meetings noted on the schedule as she claimed they are open meetings. Chair Kelly replied the last couple of months there were no agenda review meetings, but has addressed the proposed agenda via email. He said he attended agenda review meetings for over two years and they weren't very productive. These meetings were open meetings and anyone was welcome to come. Chair Kelly believes there is a better mechanism to address the agenda rather than physically showing up to look at it. Trustee Ritter then suggested the Board hold off on finalizing the schedule until they determine how to handle the agenda review. She suggested having a regular meeting to review the agenda and then have the regular meeting two weeks later. Chair Kelly replied when Chair Kuhn held agenda review meetings it was primarily Chair Kuhn, Trustee Davis and he who attended the meetings. Secretary Foster noted to Chair Kelly that currently they are following the Board policy on agenda review, which requires no formal meeting, and if they wish to consider changing the format they may wish to change the policy first.

Trustee Sullivan suggested having a Board meeting every other month and on the odd months hold workshops to have discussions such as Trustee Ritter had suggested. Chair Kelly responded last month when the suggestion was raised, his initial thoughts were six meetings a year weren't enough to run the College. However, he thought the workshops were productive. What Board workshops do is focus on the data and the information without worrying about deciding the issue. These matters can then be placed on the regular agenda for public deliberation and action. He believes such items as the budget and tuition increase are better presented in workshops. Trustee Bryant voiced she likes the idea, but in her experience during the past five years we have had workshops when we needed them. In lieu of all of the people who tried to talk with us tonight, Trustee Bryant said she would feel we would be remiss if we shut down the opportunity to continue these conversations. Chair Kelly agreed.

Trustee Ritter stated she feels the workshops are very helpful. From her standpoint she stated she likes to prepare for things, so she would like to receive information prior to the meeting so she can put things in perspective.

Chair Kelly concluded he liked Trustee Sullivan's idea of making a notation of "as needed" by the July and December meeting dates. Trustee Sullivan asked who will determine if these meetings will take place, and Chair Kelly replied it could be decided at the prior meeting whether the July or December meeting would be necessary.

Trustee Bryant asked for the motion to be read back to the Board. Secretary Foster noted Trustee Sullivan's friendly amendment to Trustee Bryant's motion would read: To approve the 2013-2014 18- month Board of Trustees Regular Meeting and Conference Schedule dates with the July and December meeting dates being designated "as needed," per Board Travel Expense Policy 1.6.5A. approve the attendance of Board members during this 18-month schedule from two to three trips at the conferences noted, and authorize related travel expenses. Trustee Ritter stated she feels every meeting is needed and can't vote in favor of the amendment.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Sullivan

NAYS: Ritter Motion Carried

Trustee Bryant believes we should hold the July meeting to discuss the questions brought forward to the Board tonight.

Trustee Bryant MOVED for the Board to hold the regular meeting scheduled for July 16, 2013. Trustee Ritter seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

# **6 NEW BUSINESS**

6.1 Board of Trustees MCCA Representative and Alternative Representative

Trustee Sullivan MOVED the Board of Trustees elect Shirley Bryant as representative to the MCCA Board of Directors and Pamala Davis as alternate representative to the MCCA Board of Directors for a term beginning July 15, 2013 and ending July 14, 2014. Trustee Ritter seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

# 6.2 Board IT Committee

Chair Kelly noted Trustee Kuhn asked this item be placed on the agenda, but he left the meeting. Chair Kelly stated he believes Trustee Kuhn wants a committee to be formed to look at the IT needs of the Board.

Trustee Ritter MOVED to adjourn the matter to the July meeting. Trustee Bryant seconded.

Board of Trustees June 18, 2013 Page **12** of **18** 

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

# 6.3 Arts, Beats and Eats Festival

Trustee O'Sullivan asked what role OCC was going to play in the Arts, Beats and Eats Festival as she feels it benefits both the City of Royal Oak and the College. She understands there was a verbal agreement, and would like to hear the Chancellor's input.

Dr. Meyer stated this has been a continuing conversation since Arts, Beats and Eats landed in Royal Oak several years ago. Dr. Meyer asked to turn this matter over to Dave Ong, who is the Chair of the OCC Foundation Board and is the OCC representative in discussions with the City of Royal Oak. Dr. Meyer noted our relationship is not with Mr. Witz, who is a promoter of the festival, but directly with the City. We also have Dr. Reif [President of Royal Oak/Southfield Campus], who is a local contact, as well as Mr. Brantley who can address the issue financially. Dr. Meyer continued it is important we as a Board and as a community have a clear understanding of this conversation.

Mr. Ong noted there are two seemingly unrelated items here. One is with the Arts, Beats and Eats Festival and the other is acquiring a small, less than a half-acre piece of property contiguous to our Royal Oak Campus. We have sought to negotiate with the City for years, even preceding Arts, Beats and Eats, our interest in that property. Every year discussions have taken place for the purchase of this property. Last August, Mr. Ong came before the Board for ratification of the purchase of this property. The purchase agreement then went before the City in September. Mr. Ong stated following a meeting with the City in November, the purchase agreement was redrafted and sent back. The City met in February citing eight issues, which Mr. Ong agreed to an amendment of all except two. The exceptions were the City wanted to make our parking deck available to the public at off hours year round, not just during Arts, Beats and Eats. This would cause liability and labor issues for OCC. Conversations took place again in March. They tabled our offer because of interest expressed by a hotel developer. For three years we provided use of our parking deck to a great economic advantage to the City.

Dr. Reif reiterated the property concern began prior to Arts, Beats and Eats. A group of OCC staff were invited to one of the City Commissioner's homes. The group included Dave Adams (at the time was Interim President at the Royal Oak/Southfield Campus), Clarence Brantley (at the time Interim Chancellor), and Steve Reif (at the time Interim Vice-Chancellor of Academic Affairs). Mr. Fresard wanted to sell the piece of property, and at the time the City Commission had very little money. City officials in Royal Oak didn't want a bidding war against the College because our pockets were a lot deeper than the City. We were told by the City if we were to refrain on bidding they would acquire the piece of property for OCC and then sell to us at no further cost. OCC agreed. However, once the City acquired the property, they completely ignored their agreement with the College. Since then, we approached the City on numerous occasions, but the

City never agreed they made these overtures. At one point during discussions, one of the City officials threatened to shut down the College and do whatever was necessary to extend Arts, Beats and Eats beyond the campus so that students could not move into the College's building (said to Dr. Reif and Mr. Ong). We continued discussions with the City and offered them the continued use of the property as a parking lot without charge.

From an economic perspective, Dr. Reif explained to the City although we do not pay property taxes, we have approximately 13,000 students at Royal Oak and Southfield on a daily basis. Dr. Reif spoke with the merchants in Royal Oak and received an agreement from many of them that they would make discounts available to our students to keep the money in Royal Oak. So even though they were not receiving property tax from the College, they were receiving retail interest.

Dr. Meyer spoke with Dennis Cowan this morning who was in contact with Mr. Witz and informed him we would be supplying the north lot for the DIA and for the kids' lot. Mr. Witz' letter is in error as we are accommodating his request. It's important for the Board and the community to understand every time we negotiated the parking lot, we have also brought up the issue of the property. This has been going on for three years now. Also, Dr. Meyer said we do not make money from this venture, and Dr. Reif confirmed we have lost money every year we have participated.

Trustee Davis commented she doesn't think OCC should want anything so badly that we're going to have a city dangle it in front of us. If they have made up their minds not to sell it to us, there's not much we can do. She continued she doesn't feel Arts, Beats and Eats should suffer from this dispute. Therefore, if it is our parking structures we should manage it, receive the profit, and create scholarships from the proceeds.

Trustee Sullivan agrees with Trustee Davis stating we've been a good neighbor for the past three years and haven't made a penny per Mr. Brantley. He personally would not recommend making the parking structure available to the City for Arts, Beats and Eats. OCC can manage the parking, receive the profits, and the City doesn't need to receive a penny.

Trustee Bryant agrees with Trustees Davis and Sullivan. She doesn't understand the lack of ability to cooperate, and she is somewhat offended that Royal Oak seems to think our property is their right to control when OCC property belongs to all of the people in Oakland County. Trustee Bryant feels badly that Arts, Beats and Eats gets caught up in the middle.

Trustee Ritter stated somewhere along the line she learned in public service you can never make a verbal agreement. We either should have locked it in or we are done.

Chair Kelly noted we should deal with it this year. He stated he can understand why Administration wants to leverage the use of our parking structure to get an answer from Royal Oak on the sale of the property. He stated he has walked the property and

feels it should be part of the College. He believes OCC would have gotten into bidding, and we did sit on the sidelines. It makes a lot of sense to him OCC would have bought the property. He hopes we can have communication with the City or their counsel to receive positive feedback. He also doesn't want to put Arts, Beats and East at risk because he believes the City needs the event for revenue and needs the parking.

Trustee Davis stated she's a bit unclear as to why we need this property so badly. Dr. Meyer responded we're seeing an increased enrollment in Royal Oak. As evidence, we went to weekend college at Royal Oak to increase our classroom capacity. With the Royal Oak facility, we can't build up and very possibly will have to consider expanding that campus within the next five years. Also, the Royal Oak Campus requires some extensive repairs. If we get into that level of construction, the College may just choose to expand at that time.

Trustee Sullivan asked Mr. Brantley how much gross revenue we received for the last three years on the parking structure. Mr. Brantley said last year the City indicated they generated about \$76,000. The City paid OCC 26 percent of that. Given the history of this matter over the past three years, Trustee Sullivan feels very strongly we do not do business with the City as we have in the past three years. We can either make the parking structure available, so we can make \$76,000, or the City can write us a check for \$50,000 or \$60,000 beforehand.

Mr. Witz stated the festival would love for OCC to acquire the property in the terms stated. He also voiced it's great to hear OCC would operate the parking structure. One of his concerns is how to handle the folks in the downtown. Mr. Witz stated there is a contract with the College for the north parking lot. In relation to the net revenue, he thinks it's fair to ask what the College's expenses were with the parking structure. Regarding the parking structure, the City has expenses operating it. Mr. Witz said from a taxpayer perspective it is important to the event that revenue goes to public services. Mr. Witz appreciated the Board wanting to hear all sides to this matter.

Trustee Bryant wanted to make sure of Trustee Davis' decision, if an agreement is not made regarding the property, OCC would run the parking structure for the Arts, Beats and Eats event.

Chair Kelly noted the City gets a big chunk of the parking revenue. Mr. Witz said they receive nothing. Chair Kelly said he wasn't sure if the City didn't have that income they would be so willing to cooperate with the festival. Mr. Witz said that is not correct. Chair Kelly responded OCC will take the revenue. Mr. Witz said it would create a big issue if the Royal Oak taxpayers would have two bad days for the festival and not have the revenue from OCC's parking structure.

Trustee Sullivan said it is difficult to put this off until July as we are getting down to the wire. He thinks the Board needs to give Administration some direction as to how to address this matter.

Chair Kelly said he did not think it inappropriate to make a motion along the lines of Trustee Davis' suggestion: We will make the parking lot available, we will run it, and we will collect the revenues from it. If Royal Oak wants to do anything differently, they can come back to us before our meeting on July 16<sup>th</sup> with some sort of a proposal. Chair Kelly said we deal with this every summer and both sides as well as the festival need to have an understanding of how we are going to do this moving forward.

Chair Kelly MOVED the Chancellor does not have authority to enter into an agreement with Royal Oak to use our parking structure for the Arts, Beats and Eats Festival. Trustee Sullivan seconded it.

Chair Kelly said he was willing to amend his motion to use the parking structure for Arts, Beats and Eats. We are not, however, going to enter into the previous agreements with the City of Royal Oak on how we divide the money unless we hear something from Royal Oak.

Trustee Bryant asked for the motion to be read back. Chair Kelly stated he would break down his original motion and his amendment into two separate motions.

Chair Kelly MOVED the Chancellor does not have authority to enter into an agreement with the City of Royal Oak to use our parking structure for the Arts, Beats and Eats Festival. Trustee Sullivan seconded it.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

Chair Kelly MOVED the College is prepared to allow the use of the parking structures in Royal Oak for the purpose of Arts, Beats and Eats and will reach an agreement with the festival on those grounds. Trustee O'Sullivan seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

#### 6.4 Board Interaction

Trustee Ritter MOVED to adjourn this item to the next meeting. She indicated to Chair Kelly she will provide him with a proposal of what she would like covered. Chair Kelly suggested she address this at agenda review. Secretary Foster asked if there was a second to Trustee Ritter's motion. Trustee Ritter said she will withdraw her motion.

#### 7 COMMUNITY COMMENTS

# 7.1 Board Member Reports and Comments

Trustee Bryant asked if Dr. Meyer could shed some light on some of the topics presented tonight. It is her understanding there are no plans to close down the ceramics program, and Dr. Meyer answered no. She also heard individuals were taking classes for 29 years; they've taken classes at Auburn Hills, Highland Lakes, Orchard Ridge, Royal Oak; someone else can't go a semester without a pottery class. In her experience, this type of involvement is considered continuing education or enrichment. Every other college Trustee Bryant knows of has a continuing education program. The Board does appreciate art. But we are now charging \$76.40 per credit hour for every person who takes that program for 29 years, and we heard from Mr. Brantley that generally OCC programs cost \$300 per credit hour. That is not fair to the citizens and tax payers we represent. Trustee Bryant would like to see the program operating in a more sensible manner.

Trustee Bryant voiced she would like to hear more about the nursing program.

Trustee Bryant also referenced Mr. Faye who stated we are not hiring full-time faculty. She went on to address Dr. Meyer stating she had previously asked him if we were complying with the Master Faculty Agreement of maintaining 290 full-time faculty and Dr. Meyer had replied yes to her. She asked him if that is accurate. Dr. Meyer replied if we weren't in compliance we would see a grievance. That being said, Trustee Bryant said she doesn't understand that accusation and would like additional information. These are all complex issues that need to be addressed and this further reinforces the need for a July meeting. Trustee Bryant expressed she believes a lot of this negativity is due to the call for OCC change in the College Brain Trust Reports.

Trustee Bryant also noted during last month's meeting the Board was booed from the staff in the overflow room, and as a volunteer citizen on the Board she was extremely offended. She concluded the staff is asking for the Board's respect, and she said she would like to ask on behalf of the Board the same from the staff.

Trustee Sullivan noted there were two presentations tonight on the ceramics program. One individual is a professional ceramist who has been taking classes at OCC for 29 years, so he assumes she has a level of proficiency and is not a student anymore. Trustee Sullivan questions if this person is using our classroom as a studio. Another individual referenced her sister takes the course and has customers, which Trustee Sullivan interprets as making a profit from the ceramics classes she takes. So, are those classes being used as a studio to generate products so they can sell them. He doesn't believe the College is in that business.

Trustee Davis came across an individual who was displaying ceramics for sale and had her business card displayed. Trustee Davis complimented the individual, who responded OCC has the best program going. Trustee Davis said she's never been against art, and

ceramics should be offered. However, with the cost of clay and having a kiln available, it becomes an expense and she believes OCC should be limiting the number of times a ceramics class can be taken. Currently, it's very convenient and cheap for individuals to take advantage of these classes. She feels they should be paying a course fee for the materials and then they can take it as many times as they wish.

Chair Kelly agrees, however, he went on to say sometimes these Board meetings aren't the best way to communicate with the Board. There's nothing preventing five new issues coming before the next meeting.

Trustee Bryant gave her compliments to the Math faculty for the fine showing of our students in the math competition.

# 7.2 Organizations and Associations

OCCFA President Mary Ann McGee noted a couple of brief observations. When the Board passes a budget there is a lot of intention embedded in the budget, such as allocations to developmental ed., to tutoring, and the direction of the institution. Ms. McGee noted she provided the Trustees with a copy of a report just issued from the American Association of University Professors (AAUP) on "Faculty Communication with Governing Boards: Best Practices." Ms. McGee also suggested holding the Board meetings in a larger venue. The Royal Oak clay program has worked toward constraining resource use and to eliminate the use of the program to supply for personal gain. There have been a lot of policies put into place addressing those concerns raised by the Board. Finally, Ms. McGee addressed the count in the Faculty Master Agreement; 290 is the minimum amount, not the maximum. One of the biggest concerns Mr. Faye was trying to address was up to this point we delivered a developmental education in an integrated model within our English and math departments using current faculty and adjuncts. Now we're hiring six more people this year to do only developmental education. So the issue isn't people living up to the contract, it is really a question of where we are committing resources and what is the underlying philosophy.

#### **8 ADJOURNMENT**

Trustee Bryant MOVED to adjourn the meeting, and Trustee O'Sullivan seconded.

AYES: Bryant, Davis, Kelly, O'Sullivan, Ritter, Sullivan

NAYS: None Motion Carried

Board of Trustees June 18, 2013 Page **18** of **18** 

Chair Kelly adjourned the meeting at 10:	35 p.m
Cherie A. Foster	
Date	
Daniel J. Kelly, Chair	
Pamala M. Davis, Secretary	